What is the problem?

Who is effected?
Where are they?
What is the goal
And
Your Role

- What are the two main problems your agency is try to solve?
- What are the constraints?
- Is there institutional and mission alignment?
- Is the intervention called for transactional or transformational?
Problem of despair
Pa drug overdose
More than twice the national avg
Nation of Problem

Law enforcement problem
Health problem
What are the demographic data on problem?
STOP "OTHERING" ME!

WHAT'S "OTHERING"?

YOUR KIND COULD NEVER UNDERSTAND.
Othering is a generalized set of common processes that engender marginality and group-based inequality across any of the full range of human differences.
The opposite of Othering is *not* sameing but belonging.
Racial Demographics and Projections for Pennsylvania
Pennsylvania Median Household Income by Race

- Whites, $62,889
- African Americans, $37,535
- Asians, $74,157
- Hispanics, $39,973
Death by despair

Why and who and where?
Not Belonging Has Consequences

A Black Yale Student Was Napping, and a White Student Called the Police

Starbucks C.E.O. Apologizes After Arrests of 2 Black Men
Two Competing Visions

• The first vision is of a smaller, and more hierarchical “We”
  ➢ This is based on fear, control, and purity, and one that dominates and controls the “other” and the earth.

• The second vision is of a more inclusive, and larger “We.”
  ➢ This vision is one where we learn to share the earth and love and care for one another.

• These visions are competing with each other across the globe.
Belonging or being fully human means more than having access. Belonging entails being respected at a basic level that includes the right to both co-create and make demands upon society.
A Beloved Community
Dr. King’s Legacy is a Call for Belonging
The Circle of Human Concern
Sawubona – I See You!
**Belonging** connotes something fundamental about how groups are structurally positioned within society as well as how they are perceived and regarded. There’s an *affective*

Belonging is more than joining a club – it is about co-creating and co-owning structures to belong.
Belongingness Intervention

- **UT-Austin Intervention** - Targeted messages seemed to help individuals overcome doubts about belonging and their academic potential.

- **Effects of the Intervention**
  - Tripled the percentage of African-American students who earned G.P.A.s in the top quarter of their class, and it cut in half the black-white achievement gap in G.P.A.
  - Significantly decreased the number of health visits by African-American students.

Vanessa Brewer
Many studies show that belonging and group identity impacts performance. There is a direct correlation between students belonging and doubts about their ability to perform well in academic settings. This doubt creates an incentive to drop out of school, thus continually perpetuating the cycle of “othering” in the nation’s collegiate system.

In addition to demographic change, technological change, inequality and migration, another stressor is hyper-individualism.

Both post-traumatic stress disorder – the trauma experienced by veterans – and even post-partum depression – are exacerbated by our hyper-individualistic society, that does not make people feel cared for.

In his book “Tribe,” Sebastian Junger writes “Modern society has gravely disputed the social bonds that have always characterized the human experience.”
Narratives of Othering and Belonging

**Breaking:** When a group turns inwards and explicitly pushes away from other groups who are seen as dangerous or a threat.

**Bonding:** Connecting to people like you in some important way.

**Bridging:** Ties to people who are unlike you in some important way; stories, structure contact.
Putnam’s Theory of Social Capital

Bonding

Bridging

Linking

Breaking
Examples of breaking social capital:

**BREAKING**
Social ties among an exclusive group who explicitly push away from other groups who are seen as dangerous or a threat.

**WHITE NATIONALISM**

![Image showing white nationalist activities](image-url)
BONDING
Social ties that link people together with others who are primarily like them along some key dimension. These are genuinely easier to build than bridging social capital.

Examples of bonding social capital:

- FAMILY
- NEIGHBORHOOD
Examples of bridging social capital:

**BRIDGING**

Social ties that link people together with others across a cleavage that typically divides society.

LGBTQ

Mosque in New Zealand
There is **hard breaking** and **soft breaking**. Hard breaking is building a wall, a travel ban, or outright exclusion.

Some breaking is defensive:
- Booker T. Washington’s campaign for self-help under the oppression of Jim Crow segregation is an example of this.

- Similarly, break away or autonomous movements such as those initiated by the Kurds of northern Iraq is defensive breaking.
There are short bridges and long bridges.

Some bridges require more effort to build and maintain. Others are a short distance.

As bell hooks reminds us, bridges are walked on.
Bridging
Bridging On the One Hand, Breaking on the Other

BRIDGING
Social ties that link people together with others across a cleavage that typically divides society.

BREAKING
Social ties among an exclusive group who explicitly push away from other groups who are seen as dangerous or a threat.
We are all situated within structures but not evenly.

Structures are not neutral.

Power gives us greater positive access to structures and more ability to shape structures.

These structures interact in ways that produce a differential in outcomes.
Structures limit and enhance opportunity

We can define opportunity through access to:

- EDUCATION
- ECONOMIC
- TRANSPORTATION
- FOOD
- HOUSING
- JUSTICE
- HEALTHCARE
- COMMUNICATIONS

This is an issue of membership and belonging.
Concentrated Poverty

- Poverty is uneven and about belonging

- Only 12.3 percent of white children and 10 percent of white adults live below the poverty line, compared to 37.1 percent of black children and 22.6 percent of black adults

- Poverty is not simply lack or lowness of income, it is also a lack of capacities
• Using 2007-2011 census estimates, 3 out of 4 persons living in high-poverty neighborhoods or neighborhoods of concentrated poverty were non-white. Concentration of poverty is highest for blacks; half of all people living in concentrated poverty in the United States are black.

• Among white families who experience poverty in the US, two-thirds are poor for only three year or less, and only 2 percent are impoverished for more than 10 years. For example, many people report low or negative income when they enroll in college or become graduate students, or as they open or start businesses. In contrast, 17 percent of African-Americans are poor for ten or more years.

• While only 44 percent of poor people will be poor for the next 4 to 10 years, for blacks, that number is 61 percent.
Equality – Equality is equal treatment, even if outcomes are unequal.

Equity – Interventions allow different, but fair treatment.

Inclusion – Allowing members of excluded groups to participate in institutions or organizations.

Equitable Inclusion – Allowing members of excluded groups to participate in a fair and equitable manner in institutions.

Belonging - Belonging or being fully human means more than having access. Belonging entails being respected at a basic level that includes the right to both co-create and make demands upon society.
Belongingness interventions communicate not only that someone belongs, but it shapes how they **feel about and regard the thing to which they belong to.**
Universal Policies Fall Short

Universalism is the Bonding of Policymaking

- Universal programs alone are not truly universal.
- Often based on a non-universal standard.
Universalism?
(Or structural exclusion in the making)
Universalism/Bonding

Community Reinvestment Act

[Image of a cityscape with various community activities and a map of Philadelphia]
Why Targeted Universalism
Equity efforts can be directed towards transactional or transformative change. Both are sometimes needed, but we should not confuse the two.

**Transactional Change:** A change within existing structures.

**Transformative Change:** A change to existing structures.

**What might this look like in a clinic setting?** Perhaps given certain structures, to enact transformative change, we must change our strategies: pursue State court claims instead of higher courts that uphold discriminatory structures.
Not only are people situated differently with regard to institutions, people are situated differently with regard to infrastructure.

Why T/U?
People are differently situated

People are impacted by the relationships between institutions and systems...

...but people also impact these relationships and can change the structure of the system.
Belonging includes the power to co-create.
Targeted Universalism Primer

important report on targeted universalism.

Opportunity mapping

opportunity mapping